



| | |
|----------|--|
| To: | news@milnews.ca |
| Subject: | FW: Afghanistan: smooth talk and rough roads |
| Date: | Thu, 6 Dec 2007 16:18:32 -0400 |

- > From: director@cda-cdai.ca
- > To: ;
- > Subject: Afghanistan: smooth talk and rough roads
- > Date: Thu, 6 Dec 2007 12:14:30 -0500
- >
- >
- >
- >
- > (note: please copy-paste links to your browser; for CF addressees, you may
- > need to remove the asterisks * in the links)
- >
- > Dear Colleagues,
- >
- > The Conference of Defence Associations (CDA) would like to draw your
- > attention to recent themes in media coverage on Canada's mission in
- > Afghanistan:
- >
- > - Canadian policy towards its mission in Afghanistan, especially related to
- > the work of the Independent Panel on Canada's Future Role in Afghanistan,
- > headed by the Honourable John Manley.
- >
- > - Developments on-the-ground in Afghanistan.
- >
- > - Developments in NATO politics and policy.
- >
- > CANADIAN POLICY TOWARDS AFGHANISTAN
- >
- > Alec Castonguay in Le Devoir (see link below) writes on the work of the
- > Independent Panel, and the relationship of its work to political affairs. It
- > also reports on the cost of the mission, quoting the CDA's executive
- > director. The article goes on to discuss the overall NATO deployment and
- > individual contributions to it. He also writes a piece on the rising cost of
- > Canada's mission in Afghanistan and equipment for the CF. Alan Freeman in
- > the Globe and Mail (see link below) writes on this as well.
- >

> Allan Woods in the Toronto Star (see link below) writes on specific
> proposals received by the Independent Panel, including the CDA's own
> submission (see link below), which is quoted at length. He also reports on
> an interview with Roland Paris (see link below), who proposes an extension
> of the Canadian mission in Afghanistan: "Faced with the complexities of
> organizing the 37-member NATO mission and finding replacement troops while
> trying to increase the overall force, he suggested that Canada extend its
> mission to 2010 and immediately serve notice that it intends to rotate out
> of Kandahar province. That would allow a new U.S. president to take office
> and possibly redeploy troops from Iraq and let Britain, France and Australia
> offer troops to NATO." An editorial in the National Post (see link below) is
> supportive of Professor Paris' comments.

>
> The Senlis Council has also released its recommendations to the Independent
> Panel, with a proposal to have Afghan farmers grow an ingredient critical to
> malaria medicine. Mike Blanchfield has filed a report on this release for
> the Ottawa Citizen (see links below).

>
> In terms of its recommendations to the Independent Panel, the CDA agrees
> with the broad recommendations of the Senlis Council, in particular, their
> call staying the course in Kandahar and for not having an artificial
> deadline for withdrawal,
> for clear-cut objectives for the Afghan mission, and having a greater troop
> presence from
> NATO countries and providing greater security in order to provide secure
> environments for reconstruction and development. Once more, the CDA directs
> you to an article by General (Retired) Paul Manson on possible criteria for
> determining when to exit Afghanistan (see link below).

>
> However, as in our previous reference to Senlis Council reports, we urge
> such recommendations to be based on sound military analysis and not on
> isolated incidents. Furthermore, drawing comparisons between possible
> consequences of NATO withdrawal from Afghanistan and the failures of
> Srebrenica and Rwanda is stretched: while the latter two cases were cases of
> failure by the larger international community, they were not NATO failures,
> but United Nations ones.

>
> Nipa Banerjee in the Ottawa Citizen (see link below) writes that there are
> no quick and easy solutions to Afghanistan, writing that the effort will
> take generations and not yield immediate results.

>
> In that vein, the CDA would like to direct your attention to Colonel George
> Petrolekas' submission to the Independent Panel, available online at our
> website (see link below).

>

- > Two articles in the Calgary Herald (see link below) comment on the link
- > between the drug/poppy trade and the Taliban insurgency. They note that the
- > Taliban are profiting from the trade, which weaker farmers cannot hope to
- > abandon. It is noted that there is no easy solution to this problem, given
- > that infrastructure is damaged, there is rampant insecurity; they also note
- > that eradication will just lead to destitution, and buying the poppy product
- > is not quite feasible as there is already a glut in the international
- > market.
- >
- > Andrew Cohen in the Ottawa Citizen (see link below) writes that Canada's
- > rhetoric or "talk" far outstrips its actual commitments, or "walk," in terms
- > of tackling environmental problems, being an "energy superpower,"
- > humanitarian aid, and spending on our military and diplomatic services.
- >
- > On that note, the CDA would like to draw your attention to a speech by
- > Gareth Evans, President of the International Crisis Group, on the
- > Responsibility to Protect (R2P) and common misunderstandings about its
- > application. A link is also provided to the original Canadian-sponsored
- > International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty of 2001,
- > which was co-chaired by Gareth Evans and included Dr. Michael Ignatieff.
- >
- > Links:
- >
- > Alec Castonguay. "Afghanistan: des coûts de prolongement inconnus." Le
- > Devoir, 4 December 2007.
- > <http://www.ledevoir.com/2007/12/04/167184.html>
- >
- > Alec Castonguay. "Afghanistan: flambée des achats de munitions." Le Devoir,
- > 3 December 2007.
- > <http://www.ledevoir.com/2007/12/03/167060.html>
- >
- > Alan Freeman. "Afghan mission costs up sharply, MacKay says." Globe and
- > Mail, 30 November 2007.
- > [http://www.theglobeandmail.com/servlet/story/RTGAM.20071130.wdefencegta30/BN](http://www.theglobeandmail.com/servlet/story/RTGAM.20071130.wdefencegta30/BNStory/Afghanistan/home)
- > Story/Afghanistan/home
- >
- > Allan Woods. "Manley's war panel flooded with requests." Toronto Star, 3
- > December 2007.
- > <http://www.thestar.com/News/article/281945>
- >
- > Conference of Defence Associations. "Submission to the Independent Panel on
- > Canada's Future Role in Afghanistan." November 2007.
- > http://www.cda-cdai.ca/Policy_Statements/IndepPanelAfghanistanNov2007.pdf
- >
- > Allan Woods. "Afghan mission extension proposed." Toronto Star, 5 December

- > 2007.
- > <http://www.thestar.com/News/article/282659>
- >
- > Editorial. "Stay the course in Afghanistan." National Post, 6 December 2007.
- > <http://www.nationalpost.com/story-printer.html?id=147191>
- >
- > Senlis Council. "Recommendations to the Independent Panel on Canada's Future Role in Afghanistan." December 2007.
- > http://www.senliscouncil.net/modules/publications/manley_report
- >
- > Mike Blanchfield. "Tories downplay Taliban strength, think-tank says."
- > Ottawa Citizen, 6 December 2007.
- > <http://www.canada.com/components/print.aspx?id=6675c0d5-aa8d-4be6-a3c7-806ab7443165>
- >
- > Paul Manson. "A Rational Exit Strategy for Afghanistan." June 2006.
- > http://www.cda-cdai.ca/CDA_Commentary/Manson_Afghanistan_Exit_Strategy.pdf
- >
- > Nipa Banerjee. "What the Critics Don't Get About Afghanistan." Ottawa Citizen, 4 December 2007.
- > <http://www.canada.com/ottawacitizen/news/story.html?id=3580fb68-cd92-407e-9c67-432c13e809c5>
- >
- > George Petrolekas. Submission to Independent Panel. 18 November 2007.
- > http://www.cda-cdai.ca/CDA_Commentary/Panel-Petrolekas.pdf
- >
- > Sarah McGinnis. "Poppies key to Taliban defeat." Calgary Herald, 30 November 2007.
- > <http://www.mapinc.org/newscfdp/v07/n1384/a09.html>
- >
- > Editorial. "Turning off the drug taps will help defeat Taliban." Calgary Herald, 30 November 2007.
- > <http://www.mapinc.org/newscfdp/v07/n1384/a10.html>
- >
- > Andrew Cohen. "Canada is all talk." Ottawa Citizen, 4 December 2007.
- > <http://www.canada.com/ottawacitizen/columnists/story.html?id=f0b87299-2462-4c73-85aa-bc5cfd794166>
- >
- > Gareth Evans. "Delivering on the Responsibility to Protect: Four Misunderstandings, Three Challenges and How To Overcome Them." 30 November 2007.
- > <http://www.crisisgroup.org/home/index.cfm?id=5190>
- >
- > International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty.
- > <http://www.iciss-ciise.gc.ca/>

>

> AFGHANISTAN - ON THE GROUND

>

> Mitch Potter in the Toronto Star (see link below) writes an interesting
> article on a meeting between CF members and local tribal elders in Panjwayi
> district, where discussion focused on security and aid and the need to
> involve foreign forces and local leaders in a combined effort against the
> Taliban.

>

> Murray Brewster for the Canadian Press (see link below) writes a 'good news'
> story on how the crew of a Leopard-2 "M" model tank survived IED strikes in
> Afghanistan. The CDA's executive director is quoted as saying, "The Leopards
> are an extremely accurate direct fire weapon, far more accurate than air
> strikes . . . Civilian casualties is a major issue for both Canadians and
> Afghans and the tanks are proving their worth."

>

> Kelly Cryderman for the Calgary Herald (see link below) writes on the
> deployment of Leopard tanks in Afghanistan, near Kandahar City.

>

> Ron Synovitz for Radio Free Europe (see link below) writes on how a
> resurgent Taliban is hampering reconstruction and development efforts by
> making areas unsafe and insecure for development workers. A report in the UK
> Times (see link below) reports on the leak of a UN map that shows an
> expansion of no-go areas for aid and development workers in Afghanistan.

>

> A Reuters piece (see link below) reports that Afghanistan's National Army
> will reach a targeted strength of 70,000 within four months. An Afghan
> official is noted as saying that the Afghan government is hoping to expand
> the army to 200,000. A report by Ann Scott Tyson in the Washington Post (see
> link below) writes on US/Afghan plans to expand the ANA and accelerate
> shipments of arms to it.

>

> Bill Graveland for the Canadian Press (see link below) writes on the
> challenges and dangers faced by CF members who provide security for supply
> convoys. He also writes on the efforts of bomb-disposal experts in the CF
> and of the treatment some civilians receive when they are injured by IEDs
> (see links below).

>

> The BBC commissioned a poll of Afghans about their attitudes towards their
> government, the Taliban, foreign forces, and their views of the future. A
> link to the results is provided below.

>

> Links:

>

> Mitch Potter. "Afghan chieftains get ultimatum." Toronto Star, 30 November

- > 2007.
- > <http://www.thestar.com/printArticle/281325>
- >
- > Murray Brewster. "Germany gets thank-you note from Canadian IED survivor."
- > Canadian Press, 5 December 2007.
- > http://cnews.canoe.ca/CNEWS/War_Terror/2007/12/05/4709453-cp.html
- >
- > Kelly Cryderman. "Canada's new Leopards leap into Afghan theatre." Calgary
- > Herald, 3 December 2007.
- > <http://www.canada.com/calgaryherald/news/story.html?id=f877858c-11fc-43b1-bf>
- > d0-fb02948180e1
- >
- > Ron Synovitz. "Afghanistan: Resurgent Taliban Slows Aid Projects,
- > Reconstruction." RFE/RL, 30 November 2007.
- > <http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/STED-79FTPP?OpenDocument>
- >
- > Nick Meo. "Leaked aid map of Afghanistan reveals expansion of no-go areas."
- > Times, 5 December 2007.
- > <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/asia/article3000067.ece>
- >
- > Reuters. "Afghan army to reach targeted strength by March." 3 December 2007.
- > <http://www.reuters.com/article/worldNews/idUSISL5175520071202>
- >
- > Ann Scott Tyson. "More Recruits, US Arms Planned for Afghan Military."
- > Washington Post, 5 December 2007.
- > <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/12/04/AR2007120402>
- > 086.html
- >
- > Bill Graveland. "Canadian security forces 'ride shotgun' for supply convoys
- > to remote outposts." Canadian Press, 2 December 2007.
- > http://cnews.canoe.ca/CNEWS/War_Terror/2007/12/02/4702586-cp.html
- >
- > Bill Graveland. "Canadian bomb disposal squad kept busy with 'the long walk'
- > in Afghanistan." Canadian Press, 5 December 2007.
- > http://cnews.canoe.ca/CNEWS/War_Terror/2007/12/05/pf-4708825.html
- >
- > Bill Graveland. "Treating Afghan kids hurt in roadside blast: day in life of
- > Canadian medics." Canadian Press, 5 December 2007.
- > http://cnews.canoe.ca/CNEWS/War_Terror/2007/12/05/pf-4708851.html
- >
- > BBC. "Afghans 'still hopeful on future'." 3 December 2007.
- > http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7124450.stm
- >
- > NATO POLITICS AND POLICY
- >

> The CDA is pleased to note that the Netherlands has decided to extend the
> mandate of its deployment in Afghanistan until August 2010, in the province
> of Uruzgan. However, the contingent's strength will be reduced to around
> 1,100 due to the arrival of troops from France, Hungary, Slovakia, and the
> Czech Republic in Uruzgan. See link below to the Dutch Ministry of Foreign
> Affairs announcement.

>
> Peter O'Neill in the National Post (see link below) reports on comments by a
> German politician that warn of the collapse of NATO unless Canada remains
> committed to Afghanistan and does not abandon efforts to convince reluctant
> European allies to send troops to dangerous areas in that country.

>
> A report by AFP (see link below) reports on the comments of French BGen
> Vincent Lafontaine, who notes that NATO-led forces are insufficient, at
> 41,000, to ensure security in Afghanistan.

>
> An editorial in the Toronto Star (see link below) writes that, "NATO, a
> powerful 26-country alliance, cannot expect the United States, Britain,
> Canada and the Netherlands to pull the most dangerous duty forever in
> Afghanistan's hot spots while the bulk of the club stays safely on the
> sidelines, paying lip-service to burden-sharing," and that this message
> should be given by the report of the Independent Panel in January 2008.

>
> Links:

>
> Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs. "Dutch troops to stay in Uruzgan until
> August 2010." 30 November 2007.
> <http://www.minbuza.nl/en/news/newsflashes,2007/11/Dutch-troops-to-stay-in-Uruzgan-until-August-2010.html>

>
> Peter O'Neill. "NATO could fail if Canada quits Afghanistan, German leader
> warns." National Post, 30 November 2007.
> <http://www.nationalpost.com/news/story.html?id=135114>
>
> AFP. "NATO force insufficient for Afghanistan - general." 29 November 2007.
> http://news.yahoo.com/s/afp/20071130/wl_sthasia_afp/afghanistanunrestnatofrance

>
> Editorial. "Canada's absent Afghan partners." Toronto Star, 6 December 2007.
> <http://www.thestar.com/comment/article/282958>

>
> CONCLUSION

>
> The CDA urges its readers to fully inform themselves on the situation in
> Afghanistan and Canada's mission there. For some useful background reading,

- > we would like to point out a US Congressional Research Service report on
- > Afghanistan, which provides a useful compilation of issues from an American
- > perspective.
- >
- > Congressional Research Service. "Afghanistan: Post-War Governance, Security
- > and US Policy." November 2007.
- > <http://italy.usembassy.gov/pdf/other/RL30588.pdf>
- >
- >
- > Alain Pellerin, Colonel (Ret'd)
- > Executive Director, CDA-CDAI / Directeur exécutif, CAD-ICAD
- > 222 rue Somerset Street West / Ouest, Suite 400B
- > Ottawa, Ontario K1R 7S7
- > T: (613) 236-1252
- > F: (613) 236-8191
- > director@cda-cdai.ca
- > www.cda-cdai.ca